

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084217 8



Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

The materials produced herein
are intended for the sole use
of law students at the
University of Toronto.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

Volume II

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN

1986

Table of Contents

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

I. <u>The Constitutional Framework: Divison of Powers and Charter of Rights</u>	2
Canadian Charter of Rights and Freedoms	3
U.S. Bill of Rights	4
Note on Impact of Charter of Rights on Family Law	4
II. <u>The Legislative Framework</u>	7
III. <u>The Institutional Framework</u>	7
A. Introduction	7
B. The Courts	7
C. Other Agencies.....	8
D. The Lawyer	8
Reisman, "Beyond the Call of Obvious Duty"	8
Mnookin & Kornhauser, "Bargaining in the Shadow of the Law: The Case of Divorce"	11
IV. <u>Some Views on the Family and Marriage</u>	14
Pope Pius XI, <u>On Christian Marriage</u>	15
Olsen, "The Family and the Market"	17
Eekelaar, <u>Family Law and Social Policy</u>	22
<u>Planned Parenthood</u>	30

CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT

I. <u>Introduction</u>	35
II. <u>The Constitutional Issue</u>	36
Bushnell, "Family Law and the Constitution"	36
III. The Regulation of the Formation of Marriage	37
A. Statutory Conditions: Licence and Formalities	37
Marriage Act	37
B. Effect of Failure to comply with statutory conditions	41
Marriage Act	41
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario"	42
<u>Alspector</u>	46
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario"	48

IV. <u>The Conditions Imposed by the Common Law</u>	49
A. Introduction	49
B. Age and parental consent	51
Marriage Act	52
<u>Re Fox</u>	53
C. A man and a woman	55
D. Who are free to marry	56
Marriage Act	57
Globe and Mail	60
E. Who Consent to marry each other	60
(1) Mental Capacity	60
Marriage Act	60
<u>Chertkow v. Feinstein</u>	61
<u>Whitaker v. McNeilly</u>	64
<u>Webb</u>	66
<u>Re McGill</u>	66
(2) Mistake as to the nature of the ceremony	69
<u>Jiwani</u>	69
(3) Mental reservations	71
<u>Gardner</u>	71
<u>Iantsis</u>	73
(4) Duress	74
<u>Thompson</u>	74
<u>Truong (Malia)</u>	79
(5) Fraud	79
<u>Moss</u>	80
F. And who are able to consummate the marriage	81
(1) What constitutes consummation	81
<u>Baxter</u>	81
<u>Wilkinson</u>	82
(2) Inability to consummate	82
<u>Heil</u>	82
<u>Gajamugan</u>	85

V.	<u>Defences to a Nullity Action: Approbation or Insincerity</u>	86
	Hahlo, Nullity of Marriage in Canada	87
VI.	<u>The Nullity Decree</u>	88
	A. Jurisdiction and other matters	88
	B. Conflicts problems	88
	C. Economic consequences	88
	D. Children	88
 <u>CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE</u>		
1.	<u>Grounds</u>	89
	A. General	89
	Green, "The Divorce Act of 1968"	90
	Divorce Act	90
	B. Immediate relief: the fault grounds	91
	(1) Adultery	91
	(a) What it is	91
	<u>Orford</u>	91
	<u>Dennis</u>	94
	(b) Proving adultery	94
	(i) Standard of proof	94
	(ii) Methods	94
	1. Physical condition	94
	2. Circumstances	95
	3. Admissions	95
	4. Other decrees	96
	<u>Coles</u>	96
	(2) Cruelty	99
	Divorce Act	101
	(a) Relevance of the common law alimony standard	101

<u>N. v. N.</u>	101
(b) Grave and weighty conduct	105
<u>Knoll</u>	105
<u>Feldman</u>	106
<u>Wittstock</u>	108
<u>Elbaz</u>	109
<u>Rishel</u>	111
(c) The relevance of intention	112
<u>Williams</u>	112
<u>Anderson</u>	112
(d) The time problem	115
C. Delayed relief: living separate and apart	116
Divorce Act	116
<u>J.B. v. A.W.B.</u>	117
<u>Dislippe</u>	121
<u>Boechler</u>	122
II. <u>Bars and Defences</u>	124
A. The possibility of reconciliation	124
Divorce Act	124
<u>Geransky</u>	124
Irving & Irving, Conciliation Counselling	125
B. Absolute bars applicable to all grounds	127
(1) Collusion	127
Divorce Act	128
Sopinka, "The Divorce Act 1968, Collusion Confined"	128
<u>Singh</u>	131
(2) Fraud	132
<u>Fromovitz</u>	132
C. Discretionary Bars	136
(1) Connivance	136
Divorce Act	136
Report of the Special Joint Committee on Divorce	136
Berger	137
(a) Consent	138
<u>T. v. T.</u>	138

(b)	The problem of investigation	140
	Fleet	140
(c)	Termination of connivance	141
	<u>Godfrey</u>	141
(2)	Condonation	144
(a)	Introduction	144
	Report of the Special Joint Committee	144
	Divorce Act	145
(b)	The common law	146
	<u>Leaderhouse</u>	147
	<u>Brown</u>	152
	<u>Aucoin</u>	153
(c)	The effect of the Divorce Act	155
	Divorce Act	155
	<u>Blackburn</u>	155
	<u>Brown</u>	156
	<u>Blue</u>	158
	<u>Roschuk</u>	160
(3)	The exercise of discretion	160
	Divorce Act	160
	<u>Blunt</u>	160
D.	Special bar applicable only to delayed relief ground	161
	Divorce Act	161
E.	The problem of insanity	162
II.	<u>Nature and Consequences of Divorce</u>	162
A.	Jurisdiction	162
	Divorce Act	162
B.	Recognition	162
	Divorce Act	162
C.	Consequences	163
(1)	Status	163
	Divorce Act	163
(2)	Economic	164
(3)	Children	164

(4) Costs	164
<u>Bregman</u>	165
<u>Andrews</u>	167

CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES"

I. <u>Introduction</u>	170
II. Ownership of Property	172
A. Introduction	172
Pearlman, Reforming the Family Law Reform Act	172
Law Reform Commission of Canada, <u>Family Property</u>	173
B. The law prior to the <u>Family Law Act</u> ; the law after: the use of trusts	181
<u>Murdoch</u>	182
<u>Pettkus v. Becker</u>	183
<u>Murray v. Roty</u>	194
<u>Sorochan</u>	198
<u>Dechene</u>	199
<u>Forget</u>	200
<u>Marvin</u>	201
C. The Family Law Act of 1986	202
(1) Provisions applicable to determining ownership as between spouses	202
(a) Standing	202
(b) Trusts and presumptions of trusts	203
(c) Private agreements: domestic contract	203
(2) Division of family property	204
(a) What is the net family property	204
(b) Power of the court in dividing property	206
(i) General	206
(ii) Prima facie equalization	206
(iii) Unequal division: unconscionability	206
(iv) Special powers of the court	207

(3) Note

- (a) the property that is subject to division 208
- (b) when will the court make an unequal division 211
 - (i) gifts 212
 - (ii) agreements 212
 - Burton 212
 - (iii) short term cohabitation 214

II. Mutual Duty of Maintenance 214

A. While Married or Cohabiting 214

- (1) Common Law 214
- (2) Family Law Act 215

B. On Breakup of Marriage or Cohabitation 215

- (1) Who can claim: the problem of "common law" spouses 215

Family Law Act 215

Re Stoikiewicz and Filas 216

Warwick v. Ministry of Community & Social Services 218

Sanderson v. Russell 220

- (2) When can claim be made? 221

(a) Nullity 221

(b) Divorce 221

Divorce Act 221

The Interaction of the Divorce Act
and the F.L.R. Act 222

Note on the Powers of the Divorce Court 222

Farquar 223

Cotter 224

- (3) What types of order can be made 225

(a) Non-monetary : The special problem of
possessory rights in the matrimonial home 225

(i)	Definition of matrimonial home	227
(ii)	Protection accorded a spouse in the matrimonial home	227
(iii)	Power of court to alter occupancy rights	228
	<u>Janssen</u>	229
	<u>Voutilainen</u>	231
	Partition Act	232
(b)	Money Awards: Types	233
(i)	Periodic payments orders	233
	Family Law Act	233
	Divorce Act	234
(ii)	Lump sum	234
(iii)	Secured	234
	Family Law Reform Act	234
	Divorce Act	234
(4)	Factors affecting momentary awards	235
(a)	Introduction	235
	Law Reform Commission of Canada	
	Maintanance on Divorce	235
	Family Law Act	241
	Divorce Act	243
(b)	When a court will order that a lump sum be paid	244
	<u>Murdoch</u>	244
	<u>Shaffran</u>	246
	<u>Feldman</u>	248
	<u>Brett</u>	249
(c)	Factors (other than counduct) affecting quantum of award	252
	<u>Davis</u>	252
	<u>Williams</u>	255
	<u>Barnard</u>	256
	<u>Messier v Delage</u>	258
	<u>Lashley</u>	264
	<u>Silverstein</u>	265
	<u>Moog</u>	269
	<u>Cohen</u>	270
(d)	The significance of conduct	273

<u>West</u>	273
<u>McCabe</u>	274
<u>Rocha</u>	277
<u>C. v C. (No. 2)</u>	278

(5) Variation of Awards	279
-------------------------------	-----

Family Law Act	279
Divorce Act	279
<u>Johnstone</u>	280
<u>McQuilkin v. Dawson</u>	283
<u>Neal</u>	285
<u>Jancov</u>	286

IV. Special Problems: Contracting Out, Welfare	289
--	-----

A. Contracting Out	289
--------------------------	-----

(1) Introduction	289
------------------------	-----

(2) Property	291
--------------------	-----

Family Law Act	291
----------------------	-----

(a) agreements that are formally valid	292
--	-----

<u>Deroon</u>	292
---------------------	-----

<u>Couzens</u>	294
----------------------	-----

<u>Lamers</u>	295
---------------------	-----

<u>Trottier</u>	296
-----------------------	-----

(b) agreements not in compliance with s.55	297
--	-----

(3) Maintenance	297
-----------------------	-----

(a) Under provincial legislation	298
--	-----

Family Law Act	298
----------------------	-----

<u>Mance</u>	299
--------------------	-----

(b) Under the Divorce Act	301
---------------------------------	-----

Divorce Act	301
-------------------	-----

<u>Newman</u>	303
---------------------	-----

<u>Webb</u>	309
-------------------	-----

<u>Joyce</u>	314
--------------------	-----

<u>McVeetors</u>	315
------------------------	-----

<u>Drewery</u>	319
----------------------	-----

<u>Pelech</u>	321
---------------------	-----

<u>Gergely</u>	325
----------------------	-----

<u>Gigantes</u>	327
-----------------------	-----

B. Welfare	328
------------------	-----

General Welfare Assistance Act	328
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 31, 1982	351
Family Benefits Act	352
Annual Report, Ministry of Community and Social Services for the Fiscal Year Ending March 31, 1982	336
Diamond, "Philosophy of Welfare"	338

CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN

I. Introduction	343
II. <u>Proving and Disproving Parenthood</u>	344
Children's Law Reform Act	344
Divorce Act	345
<u>Re H and H</u>	348
<u>Re Bagarie</u>	351
<u>Re Rhan</u>	352
<u>Ministry of Community and Social Services and Tolls</u>	354
III. <u>The Right (or Privilege) to Raise or See One's Children: Guardianship, Custody, Care and Control, Access</u>	357
A. Introduction	357
B. Private Disputes	358
(1) Custody	358
(a) Legislative framework	358
Children's Law Reform Act	358
Habeas Corpus	364
Divorce Act	365
Matrimonial Causes Act	367
(b) The general principles: what the academics have said	368
Foster and Freed, "Child Custody"	368
Moonkin, "Child-Custody Adjudication; Judicial Functions in the Face of Indeterminacy	373
(c) Powers of the court	392
(i) Who has standing to apply for custody	392
<u>Smith v. Sears</u>	393
(ii) Award to a person not a party to the action	395

	<u>Re Fulford and Townshend</u>	395
(iii)	Joint custody order	397
	<u>Kruger</u>	397
	<u>Fontaine</u>	406
	<u>Zwicker v. Morine</u>	407
	<u>Field</u>	408
(iv)	The effect of an agreement between the parties	411
	Children's Law Reform Act	411
	Family Law Act	412
	<u>Colter</u>	413
(d)	Interim Custody	414
	Children's Law Reform Act	414
	Divorce Act	414
	<u>Papp</u>	414
(e)	Permanent custody	416
	(i) The impact of conduct	416
	Divorce Act	416
	Children's Law Reform Act	417
	Note on "Kidnapping"	417
	<u>Cooney</u>	418
	<u>Bezaire</u>	422
	(ii) Race	427
	<u>Hayre</u>	428
	<u>Singh</u>	429
	(iii) Tender years and plans	431
	<u>MacDonald</u>	431
	<u>Talsky</u>	433
	<u>R v R</u>	437
	<u>Mireault</u>	443
	<u>Wakaluk</u>	445
	<u>Romeyko</u>	450
	Bayda, "Procedure in Child Custody Adjudication"	452
(f)	Custody after death of natural guardian	457
	Children's Law Reform Act	457
(2)	Disputes between parents and third parties	458
	CLRA	458
	<u>J. v C.</u>	459
	<u>K.K. v G.L.</u>	462

(3) Access	466
Divorce Act	466
Children's Law Reform Act	466
<u>Ader</u>	468
<u>Boileau</u>	473
<u>Carson</u>	475
<u>Adoption of a Child by M</u>	478
<u>Milne</u>	480
IV. Adoption	482
A. Introduction	482
Child and Family Services Act	482
L.S.U.C. Report	483
B. The Problem of Consent	485
Child and Family Services Act	485
Re A	488
<u>L and L v. Legal Aid Manitoba</u>	491
<u>Racine v. Woods</u>	491
<u>Re Windsor</u>	494
<u>Re Sobering et al and Sergeant</u>	497
C. The religious factor	499
Petch, "Re Lamb Religious considerations in Ontario Adoptions"	499
D. The search for natural parents or child	503
Child and Family Services Act	503
<u>Ferguson v. Director of Child Welfare</u>	506
Globe & Mail	508
E. Access After Adoption	508
<u>G.G.W. v M.J. et al</u>	508
<u>William v. Hillier and Hillier</u>	512
V. <u>The Parental-Child Relationship</u>	518
A. Parental Control	518
O.L.R.C., Report	518
<u>Re D.</u>	519
<u>Re L.D.K.</u>	522
B. Economic Relations	524
(1) Parental obligations to child	524
(a) General	524

Ontario Law Reform Commission, "Report on the Age of Majority "	524
(b) Legislative framework	527
Family Law Reform Act	527
Divorce Act	530
(c) The work of the courts	530
<u>Waters v. Nicholls</u>	530
<u>Re Dolabaille and Carrington</u>	532
<u>Clark</u>	535
<u>Janzen</u>	537
<u>Harrington</u>	539
<u>Chaban</u>	541
<u>Hock</u>	542
<u>Dokuchie</u>	544
<u>Walls v Hanson</u>	546
(2) The child's duty to maintain his parents	547
Family Law Act	547
<u>St. Joseph's Health Centre</u>	548

